AN INTRODUCTORY READER'S GUIDE TO THE PUBLISHED WORKS OF T. F. TORRANCE

Elmer M. Colyer Professor of Historical Theology Stanley Professor of Wesley Studies University of Dubuque Theological Seminary

ecolyer@dbq.edu

ABSTRACT: The following essay is a reader's guide to the publications of Thomas F. Torrance. The essay covers both primary and secondary literature in relation to all of the main themes of Torrance's theology and also his life. Since Torrance's publications include more that six hundred items, this essay is introductory and addressed primarily to those just beginning to read the works of Thomas F. Torrance.

Introduction

This essay, which is an introductory reader's guide to the publications of T. F. Torrance, is what I wish I had when I first started reading Torrance back in 1983. When I examined the range and sheer volume of his publications, I had no idea where to begin or how to proceed. So I stumbled my way forward, muttering repeatedly how much easier it would have been if I had read this article or book before that one and in relation to those other two or three essays on a particular subject published elsewhere. So I hope that this guide will at least save a few readers of Torrance some of the wasted time that I experienced over the first several years of studying his theology.

Since the Torrance bibliography itself runs fifty pages, it is impossible to provide a complete guide within the bounds of an essay like this one. What follows is designed primarily for those who have not yet immersed themselves



in Torrance's publications. There is no one "right" way or order to read T. F. Torrance. What follows is a basic road map guiding readers into Torrance's publications.

New readers of Torrance's work should be forewarned that there may be parts of Torrance's work that they will not understand the first time through. Seminarians in my course on Torrance's theology often have this experience. So if you are new to Torrance, keep reading, try to gain a feel for the big picture, and come back to the difficult sections at a later date. T. F. Torrance in not an easy read!

Indeed, the most complete published bibliography of Torrance's works, which is found in Alister McGrath's *T. F. Torrance: An Intellectual Biography*, includes more than six hundred items and consumes nearly fifty pages. The range of materials flowing from Torrance's pen from 1941 to 2007 is equally as impressive as the sheer volume. One finds the monographs *Space, Time, and Incarnation* (1969) and *The Hermeneutics of John Calvin* (1988), as well as pamphlets like *The Christian Doctrine of Marriage* (1984) and *Test-Tube Babies: Morals, Science, and the Law* (1984). Topics run the gamut from essays such as "The Epistemological Relevance of the Holy Spirit" (1965) and "Newton, Einstein, and Scientific Theology" (1971) to "The Spiritual Relevance of Angels" (1992) and "The Divine Vocation and Destiny of Israel in the World History" (1982).

To make matters more complex, one will look in vain for anything resembling a "Church Dogmatics," where Torrance develops the core of his theological perspective within the bounds of several carefully constructed volumes. Torrance planned, but never produced, a three-volume summary of theology, which would have played a key role in interpreting the voluminous materials he produced over his fifty-year career.

The Torrance corpus, as it stands, is rather occasional in nature. Many of his books are collections of lectures and essays rather than deliberately planned monographs on particular subjects. Beginning readers could never anticipate the deep connections that often exist between essays published in very different venues and that are chronologically separated.

⁹ Alister McGrath, T. F. Torrance: An Intellectual Biography (Edinburgh, T&T Clark, 1999).

In addition, while Torrance clearly has an architectonically rigorous theological vision that unifies the themes he treats in various publications, nowhere does he develop it in a way that readers can grasp the contours of his theology by reading a couple of books or a handful of articles. This is particularly evident with reference to the profound interconnections between "scientific" method and theological content, which is surely one of his greatest contributions to theology. His actual publications tend to focus on method or on specific theological content, without clearly delineating the relations between the two, so that only after one has read a number of books and essays on both, and then maybe several times, do these interconnections became evident.

Furthermore, even a cursory reading of Torrance's publications reveals that his theological perspective is itself *holistic* because of his profound conviction that analytic, deductive, discursive, and linear modes of thought tend to disconnect and dissolve the dynamic interrelationality of the divine and contingent realities that make them what they are. One can only grasp reality adequately by simultaneous subsidiary attention to the constitutive parts. However, the actual scope of this holism characteristic of Torrance's theological vision is scattered throughout his publications and must be reconstructed by readers who attend to its constitutive elements discussed in various essays and books.

Then there is a burgeoning body of secondary literature on Torrance's work, which offers a variety of perspectives on where to begin and how to read T. F. Torrance and his theology, along with an astonishingly fertile supply of misinterpretations leading to pointed, though ill-considered, criticisms of various dimensions of his theological oeuvre.

The combination of all these factors is that readers of T. F. Torrance, particularly those just starting out, are faced with the rather complicated task of figuring out where to begin and how to proceed. Indeed, seldom a month goes by that I do not get a request from a Ph.D. or masters student or a pastor for assistance in relation to reading Torrance's work, whether on a particular subject or in relation to this theology as a whole. So do not give up if the initial reading of Torrance is a bit of a struggle. This reader's guide is designed to make the task at least a bit easier.

In the first section of the guide, I will begin with Torrance's life as a helpful matrix within which to view his publications. The first section also deals with Torrance's overarching theological vision. It is crucial to grasp something of Torrance's convictions about what theology is and how it proceeds. This theological vision developed for Torrance in the years leading up to 1937-38 and his study under Karl Barth in Basel. Torrance pursued this vision throughout the rest of his long and varied career, developing it into the complex perspective that many of us have found so illuminating and helpful both theologically and pastorally.

After these overarching orienting subsections, this reader's guide will focus on the various theological themes that constitute Torrance's "scientific theology," beginning in his words "from its Christological and soteriological centre and in the light of its constitutive trinitarian structure," for Torrance's theology is "deeply Nicene and doxological (theology and worship going inextricably together), with its immediate focus on Jesus Christ as Mediator, and its ultimate focus on the Holy Trinity." The final section of this guide will deal with theological method and related topics.

Life and Theological Vision

Torrance, the son of missionary parents, was born on the mission field in inland China. He had planned on being a missionary himself, but he became a theologian without ever ceasing to be an evangelist. It is rather telling that in his final conversation just before he died he shared of the gospel with his Chinese nurse (according to her account). She left the room for a moment and returned to find that he had passed on.

¹⁰ Thomas F. Torrance, "My Interaction with Karl Barth" in *How Karl Barth Changed My Mind*, ed. Donald K. McKim (Grand Rapids, MI, 1986), 54. Also see I. John Hesselink, "A Pilgrimage in the School of Christ-An Interview with T. F. Torrance," *Reformed Review* 38, no. 1 (Autumn, 1984), 53.

¹¹ R. D. Kernohan, "Tom Torrance: The Man and Reputation," *Life and Work* 32, no. 5 (1976), 14. Also see Thomas F. Torrance, *The Christian Doctrine of God, One Being Three Persons* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1996), 146.

This section will note the most important discussions of Torrance's life in secondary literature as well as a number of crucial autobiographical essays from Torrance's own pen. The most complete biographical treatment of Torrance's life is found in part 1 of Alister McGrath's monumental work *T. F. Torrance:* An Intellectual Biography, pp. 3–107. It covers Torrance's entire life, includes pictures, and is quite insightful.

David Torrance wrote a delightful biographical piece on Tom from the perspective of a younger brother, titled "Thomas Forsyth Torrance: Minister of the Gospel, Pastor and Evangelical Theologian," in *The Promise of Trinitarian Theology: Theologians in Dialogue with T. F. Torrance*, ed. Elmer M. Colyer (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2001), pp. 1–30. It contains information not found in any of the other biographical and autobiographical essays.

There are three other important biographical chapters in books on Torrance's theology. The one found in Paul D. Molnar, *Thomas F. Torrance: Theologian of the Trinity* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 1–30, is not only a biographical sketch but also surveys the broad theological landscape to which Torrance dedicated his career. The second is Jock Stein's essay, "The Legacy of the Gospel," in *A Passion for Christ: The Vision that Ignites Ministry*, ed. Gerrit Dawson and Jock Stein (Edinburgh: Handsel Press, 1999), pp. 131–50. The book contains seven essays by the three Torrance brothers, Tom, James, and David, plus an introduction by Dawson. The biographical chapter by Stein tells the story of the whole Torrance family and contains information not found in any of the other essays. The other essay is my own brief discussion, "Torrance's Life and Achievement," chapter 1 of my book, *How To Read T. F. Torrance: Understanding His Trinitarian and Scientific Theology* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2001), pp. 35–51.

There are several crucial autobiographical essays by Torrance that provide invaluable information about Torrance's life and especially his theological vision. Early on in his career, in his undergraduate studies and in his later graduate work in theology, Torrance admired the architectonic beauty of Schleiermacher's "scientific system" of Christian doctrine. The problem from Torrance's perspective was that Schleiermacher's presuppositions about the nature and content of the gospel and what constitutes a "scientific" theology were all wrong.

Torrance was determined to make that his life goal: to develop a methodologically rigorous scientific theology focused on the true nature and content of the gospel.

For Torrance, a scientific theology is simply one determined by the nature of God as revealed in the gospel. In Torrance's words: "Any rigorous scientific approach to Christian theology must allow actual knowledge of God, reached through his self-revelation to us in Christ and in his Spirit, to call into question all alien presuppositions and antecedently reached conceptual frameworks, for form and subject-matter, structure and material content, must not be separated from each other."¹²

Torrance finally discovered what he was looking for "in the doctrines of the *hypostatic union* between the divine and human natures in Christ, and the *consubstantial communion* between the Persons of the Holy Trinity."¹³ Torrance knew that he was "probing into the essential connections embodied in the material content of our knowledge of God and his relation to us in creation and redemption and that it might be possible to develop a coherent and consistent account of Christian theology as an organic whole in a rigorously scientific way in terms of its objective truth and inner logic, that is to say, as a dogmatic science pursued on its own ground and in its own right."¹⁴

The following two autobiographical essays provide deep insight into Torrance's overall theological vision and should be studied closely by anyone wanting to really understand the central convictions that organize and render intelligible the various facets of Torrance's overall theology and the way Torrance's various publications dealing with how these facets fit together: (1) "A Pilgrimage in the School of Faith—An Interview with T. F. Torrance," by John Hesselink in *Reformed Review* 38, no. 1 (1984): 49-64; and (2) "My Interaction with Karl Barth," in *How Karl Barth Changed My Mind*, ed. Donald K. McKim (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1986), pp. 52–64. This essay is reprinted in Thomas F. Torrance, *Karl Barth, Biblical and Evangelical Theologian* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1990), pp. 121–35. They are also important because they reveal both Torrance's dependence on Barth and places where he self-consciously moves beyond Barth as well.

Several other important autobiographical pieces are "Interview with Professor Thomas F. Torrance," in *Different Gospels*, ed. Alan. Walker (London: Hodder

¹² Torrance, "My Interaction," p.53.

¹³ Ibid., p. 54.

¹⁴ Ibid.

& Stoughton, 1988), pp. 42–54; Michael Bauman, "Thomas Torrance," in *Roundtable Conversations with European Theologians* (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 1990), pp. 111–18; and R.D. Kernohan, "Tom Torrance: The Man and Reputation," *Life and Work* 32, no. 5 (May, 1976): 14–16.

There are two unpublished autobiographical essays worthy of note. One is Torrance's unpublished *Journal of My Visit to Hong Kong, Chengdu and Wenchuan, April 22–June 3, 1994,* which is eighty-four single-spaced pages in length. It is an account of his trip to the remote Minshan mountains of the Wenchuan area of China where he personally delivered a large gift of money to the indigenous Qiang people so that they could rebuild churches his father had established in the early twentieth century, which had been destroyed by Mao's forces in 1935. Torrance was in his eighties at the time.

The other is titled *Itinerarium in Mentis Deum* and is an eighteen-page treatment of Torrance's early intellectual development during his years at Edinburgh University. Both essays should be available in the collection of Torrance's unpublished materials assembled at Princeton Theological Seminary.

The Christological and Soteriological Center

When reading T. F. Torrance on the christological and soteriological center of his theology, *the* place to begin is the two-volume posthumously published lectures from Torrance's dogmatics courses delivered at University of Edinburgh: *Incarnation: The Person and Life of Christ* and *Atonement: The Person and Work of Christ*, ed. Robert T. Walker (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2008, 2009). We owe Robert Walker a huge debt of gratitude for his painstaking, meticulous editing of the lectures, truly a labor of love.

These volumes are such a great place to begin reading T. F. Torrance since they bear the more conversational style of the classroom and are therefore more readily accessible than some of Torrance's dense prose in works like his *Christian Doctrine of God, One Being Three Persons* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1996), which is a rather difficult read for beginners. Walker also includes an incredibly detailed synopsis of the content of each volume in outline form. This enables readers to quickly zero in on topics of interest. The second volume, *Atonement*, includes a "Brief Guide to Further Reading."

Here are the chapter titles for each of the two volumes so readers will have an idea of the topics covered in each volume:

Incarnation

Chapter 1: Introduction to Christology

Chapter 2: The Incarnation

Chapter 3: The Once and for all Union of God and Man Chapter 4: The Continuous Union in the Life of Jesus

Chapter 5: The Mystery of Christ

Chapter 6: The Hypostatic Union

Chapter 7: The Kingdom of Christ and Evil

Addendum: Eschatology

Atonement

Chapter 1: The Atonement in the New Testament

Chapter 2: Redemption in Light of the Old Testament

Chapter 3: The Priesthood of Christ

Chapter 4: The Atonement in the Teaching of Paul: Atonement as Justification

Chapter 5: Atonement as Reconciliation

Chapter 6: Atonement as Redemption

Chapter 7: The Resurrection of Jesus Christ

Chapter 8: The Nature of the Resurrection Event

Chapter 9: The Ascension and Parousia of Jesus Christ

Chapter 10: The Biblical Witness to Jesus Christ: The Coming of the Spirit and the Creation of the Apostolic Testimony and Gospel

Chapter 11: The One Church of God in Jesus Christ

Chapter 12: Jesus Christ the First and Last: the Eschatological Perspective of the Gospel

Epilogue: The Reconciliation of the Mind

Also see the long introduction to *The School of Faith: The Catechisms of the Reformed Church* (New York: Harper & Row, 1959), which is an excellent early summary of many key themes of Torrance's theology. The first two chapters by T. F. Torrance of *A Passion for Christ: The Vision that Ignites Ministry* ("The Christ

who Loves Us" and "Preaching Jesus Christ") mentioned above are very readable summaries of Torrance's Christology and Soteriology.

Beyond these outstanding and accessible volumes the following list of publications is my suggested way to read Torrance on various subtopics under the main heading of Christology/Soteriology. The order of these various essays and chapters generally begins with more accessible works but also indicates a particular sequence that I think is helpful for understanding Torrance on these themes. I include chapter titles and some comments to guide readers into the subject matter of these various publications.

The Mediation of Christ, 2nd ed. Colorado

Springs: Helmers & Howard, 1992

Chapter 1: The Mediation of Revelation

Chapter 2: The Mediation of Reconciliation

Chapter 3: The Person of the Mediator

Chapter 4: The Mediation of Christ in our Human Response

Chapter 5: The Atonement and the Trinity

The first three chapters especially place Jesus Christ within the matrix of Israel, a subject of some importance to Torrance. Readers will find various other discussions of Torrance's views on the place of Israel within the mediation of revelation and reconciliation by consulting the full bibliography of Torrance's published works in McGrath, T. F. Torrance. Chapter 4 deals with the vicarious humanity of Christ.

The Trinitarian Faith: The Evangelical Theology of the Ancient Catholic Church, Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1988

Chapter 4: God of God, Light of Light

Chapter 5: The Incarnate Saviour

While The Trinitarian Faith deals with the theology and theologians of the Nicene-Constantinopolitan creed, Torrance's own theology shines through it all. Chapter 4 contains a particularly rich discussion of the significance of the homoousion to patri, which is crucial to Torrance's theology. Other essays in this section also deal with the homoousion.

Preaching Christ Today: The Gospel and Scientific Thinking, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1994

Chapter 1: Preaching Christ Today

Chapter 2: Incarnation and Atonement in Light of Modern Scientific Rejection of Dualism

"The Atonement: The Singularity of Christ and the Finality of the Cross: The Atonement and the Moral Order." In Universalism and the Doctrine of Hell, ed. Nigel M. de S. Cameron, pp. 225–56, Grand Rapids: Baker, 1993

"Incarnation and Atonement: Theosis and Henosis in the Light of Modern Scientific Rejection of Dualism." Society of Ordained Scientists 7 (spring 1992): 8–20

These last two essays contain significant discussions of the inseparable relation between the incarnation and the atonement, the singularity and finality of Christ, and the relation of redemption to the moral order.

"Karl Barth and the Latin Heresy." Scottish Journal of Theology 39 (1986): 461–82, reprinted in Karl Barth: Biblical and Evangelical Theologian. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1990

This essay is Torrance's most damaging criticism of various accounts of the gospel in terms of "external relations" between Christ, the atonement, and humanity's sins.

"Karl Barth and Patristic Theology." In Theology beyond Christendom: Essays on the Centenary of the Birth of Karl Barth,

ed. John Thomson, pp. 215–39. Allison Park, PA: Pickwick, 1986. Reprinted in Karl Barth: Biblical and Evangelical Theologian, pp. 182–212

Reality and Evangelical Theology,

Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1982

Chapter 3: A Realist Interpretation of God's Self-Revelation

This chapter and the following chapters and essays below all deal with the mediation of revelation, especially as it is embodied in the human creaturely word, first in Israel, then preeminently in the vicarious human mind of Jesus Christ himself (the one ultimately true human theology), and then in its outfolding in the apostolic nucleus and apostolic mind that gave rise to the New Testament Scriptures.

The "Deposit of Faith" is particularly helpful in sorting out Torrance's understanding of this whole subject, which is rather complex and far more sophisticated than so many discussions of Scripture in relation to the mediation of revelation in conservative theological circles. This is one of Torrance's major contributions to the doctrine of revelation.

God and Rationality, London: Oxford University Press, 1971. Reprint, Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 1997

Chapter 6: The Word of God and the Response of Man

Space, Time and Resurrection. Edinburgh: Handsel Press, 1976

Introduction

Chapter 8: The Lord of Space and Time

"The Historical Jesus: From the Perspective of a Theologian."
In The New Testament Age: Essays in Honor of Bo Reicke, ed.
W. Weinrich, pp. 511–26. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1984

"The Deposit of Faith," Scottish Journal of Theology 36. no. 1 (1983): 1-28

Karl Barth: Biblical and Evangelical Theologian

Chapter 3: Karl Barth: Theologian of the Word

This is a crucial essay for Torrance's understanding of Scripture in relation to revelation. Even though it deals with Barth's views, Torrance's own perspective is very evident.

Also the following secondary sources are helpful:

McGrath, T. F. Torrance

Chapter 7: Revelation and Salvation: The Place of Jesus Christ in Christian Theology

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 2: The Mediation of Christ: *Homoousios*, Hypostatic Union, Atonement

Chapter 3: The Mediation of Christ: Christ's Vicarious Humanity

Elmer M. Colyer, ed. The Promise of Trinitarian Theology: Theologians In Dialogue with T. F. Torrance.

Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2001

Chapter 3: The Christology of Thomas F. Torrance, by Andrew Purves

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 4: Jesus Christ, the Incarnate Word, *Homoousion* with the Father and with Us in our Humanity

Chapter 5: Atonement: Incarnation and Reconciliation Are One in Jesus Christ

Gerrit Scott Dawson, ed. An Introduction to Torrance Theology: Discovering the Incarnate Saviour.

Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 2007. Chapters 1–3, 7–8

Torrance's early reflections in the area of Christology and soteriology are nicely summarized in his Auburn Lectures in 1938–39, published in 2002 as *The Doctrine of Christ* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2002). Also see the first two sections, titled "Knowledge of God" and "Through Jesus Christ," in *Theology in Reconstruction* (London: SCM, 1965). This volume is mostly a collection of lectures and essays previously published in various other venues. One additional brief but important essay is "The Reconciliation of Mind," *TFS Bulletin* 10, no. 3 (1987): 4–7.

God the Father, the Almighty Creator/Contingent Creation

I will divide this section into more manageable subsections. There is so much material in Torrance's publications on some of the subjects in this section (natural science and theology for instance) that I can provide only a very introductory bibliographic guide. In relation to other sections, like the one on the human

creature, Torrance only wrote a handful of essays, though there are lots of minor discussions embedded within his treatment of other topics.

The love of God the Father

The Trinitarian Faith

Chapter 2: Access to the Father

This is a masterful treatment of the whole subject captured in Athanasius's memorable aphorism, often quoted by Torrance: "It is more godly and accurate to signify God from the Son and call him Father, than to name him from his works and call him unoriginate."

The Mediation of Christ

Chapter 5: The Atonement and the Trinity

"The Christian Apprehension of God the Father." In Speaking the Christian God: The Holy Trinity and the Challenge of Feminism, ed. Alvin F. Kimel Jr., 120–43. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1992

"The Problem of Natural Theology in the Thought of Karl Barth." Religious Studies 6, no. 2 (June 1970): 121–35

The article is republished in two other places, and what is revealing are the changes Torrance introduces toward the end of the later versions. See *Transformation and Convergence in the Frame of Knowledge* (Belfast: Christian Journals Limited, 1984), pp. 285–301; *Karl Barth*, pp. 136–59.

Christian Doctrine of God, pp. 55–59, 137–41, 203–7

These brief summaries of the love of God the Father are quite revealing.

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 4: The Love of God the Father Almighty

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 3: God the Father Almighty, Maker of Heaven and Earth

The Almighty Creator

The Trinitarian Faith

Chapter 3: The Almighty Creator

Christian Doctrine of God

Chapter 8: The Sovereign Creator

Chapter 9: The Unchangeableness of God

These chapters contain important discussions of the almightiness of God, the impassibility of God, and the character of God's providence.

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 5: Sovereign Creator, Contingent Creation

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 3: God the Father Almighty, Maker of Heaven and Earth

The contingent creation

Both of the chapters under the previous subheading, "The Almighty Creator," contain material on the contingent creation. What follows are a few of Torrance's most important discussions of creation and contingence.

The Ground and Grammar of Theology.

Charlottesville, University of Virginia Press, 1980

Chapter 3: Creation and Science

"Ultimate Beliefs and the Scientific Revolution."

CrossCurrents 30 (1980): 129-49

"Divine and Contingent Order." In The Sciences and Theology in the Twentieth Century, ed. A.R. Peacocke, pp.

81-97. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1981

Divine and Contingent Order. 1981; Reprint,

Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1998

PARTICIPATIO: THE JOURNAL OF THE T. F. TORRANCE THEOLOGICAL FELLOWSHIP

Chapter 1: Determinism and Creation

Chapter 2: God and the Contingent Universe

Chapter 3: Theological and Scientific World-Views

Chapter 4: Contingence and Disorder

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 5: Sovereign Creator, Contingent Creation

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 3: God the Father Almighty, Maker of Heaven and Earth

Colyer, Promise of Trinitarian Theology

Chapter 10: Humanity in an Intelligible Cosmos: Non-Duality in Albert Einstein and Thomas Torrance, by Chistopher B. Kaiser

The human creature

"The Goodness and Dignity of Man in the Christian Tradition." Modern Theology 4 (1988): 309–22

"The Soul and Person in Theological Perspective." In Religion, Reason and the Self: Essays in Honour of Hywel D. Lewis, ed. Stewart R. Sutherland and T.A. Roberts, pp. 103–18. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1989

The Christian Frame of Mind: Reason, Order, and Openness in Theology and Natural Science. New and enlarged edn. Colorado Springs, CO: Helmers & Howard, 1989

Chapter 1: The Greek Christian Mind

Chapter 3: Man, Mediator of Order

These are Torrance's main discussions of theological anthropology, though there are other important brief articles and pamphlets on various related topics like the three that follow.

The Christian Doctrine of Marriage. Edinburgh: Handsel Press, 1984

"Donor Insemination for Single Women: The Animalisation of the Human Race." Ethics and Medicine 7 (1991)

The Soul and the Person of the Unborn Child. Edinburgh, Handsel Press, 1999

Natural science and theology

The Christian Frame of Mind

- Chapter 2: The Concept of Order in Theology and Science
- Chapter 3: Theological and Scientific Inquiry
- Chapter 4: Fundamental Issues in Theology and Science
- Chapter 5: Realism and Openness in Scientific Inquiry

The Christian Frame of Mind is probably Torrance's most accessible book dealing with the relation between natural science and theological science. Neidhardt's introduction is also excellent on this topic. The following book, *Divine and Contingent Order*, is rather difficult for beginners.

Divine and Contingent Order

- Chapter 1: Determinism and Creation
- Chapter 2: God and the Contingent Universe
- Chapter 3: Theological and Scientific World-Views
- Chapter 4: Contingence and Disorder

Transformation and Convergence in the Frame of Knowledge: Explorations in the Interrelations of Scientific and Theological Enterprise. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1984

- Chapter 7: Christian Theology in the Context of Scientific Change
- Chapter 8: Newton, Einstein and Scientific Theology

Transformation and Convergence is a difficult book. It is a collection of lectures and previously published essays, except for the crucial first chapter: "The Making of the Modern Mind from Descartes and Newton to Kant," which Torrance composed for the book itself.

McGrath, T. F. Torrance

Chapter 9: Theology and the Natural Sciences

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 5: Sovereign Creator, Contingent Creation

Colyer, Promise of Trinitarian Theology

Chapter 11: Natural Science and Christian Faith in the Thought of T. F. Torrance, by P. Mark Achtemeier

Natural theology

This is one of the more difficult subjects in Torrance's theology. Here interpreters of Torrance do not agree. Paul Molnar and I do not agree with Alister McGrath's portrayal of Torrance as advocating a kind of refurbished natural theology, one that McGrath himself tries to develop further. I see Torrance as making a place for a "theology of nature," which at one point he called "natural theology," but later regretted doing so. Torrance was kind enough to read my book, *How to Read T. F. Torrance* in manuscript and offer some helpful suggestions. Next to note 187 on page 194 of my book, where I say, "There is reason to believe that Torrance may regret calling this reformulated version 'natural theology,'" Torrance drew a huge exclamation point! Readers should compare the chapters of the first five books below with the discussions in the chapters from *The Christian Frame of Mind* and the materials listed after that.

Karl Barth

Chapter 5: Natural Theology in the Thought of Karl Barth

Ground and Grammar

Chapter: 4 The Transformation of Natural Theology

Reality and Evangelical Theology

Chapter 1: The Bounds of Christian Theology

Reality and Scientific Theology

Chapter 2: The Status of Natural Theology

The Christian Frame of Mind

Chapter 4: Theological and Scientific Inquiry

Chapter 5: Fundamental Issues in Theology and Science

Chapter 6: Realism and Openness in Scientific Inquiry

"Creation, Contingent World-Order, and Time: A Theologico-Scientific Approach." In Time, Creation and World-Order, ed. Mogens Wegner, pp. 206–36. Oakville, CN: Aarthus University Press, 1999

McGrath, T. F. Torrance

Chapter 8: The Place and Purpose of Natural Theology

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 5: Sovereign Creator, Contingent Creation

Paul Molnar, "Natural Theology Revisited: A Comparison of T. F. Torrance and Karl Barth," Zeitschrift fur dialektische Theologie 20, no. 1 (December 2005): 53–83

The Holy Spirit

Theology in Reconstruction

Chapter 14: Come, Creator Spirit, for the Renewal of Worship and Witness

This chapter and the one in *The Trinitarian Faith* are Torrance's two most important discussions of pneumatology.

Chapter 12: *Spiritus Creator*: A Consideration of the Teaching of St. Athanasius and St Basil

PARTICIPATIO: THE JOURNAL OF THE T. F. TORRANCE THEOLOGICAL FELLOWSHIP

The Trinitarian Faith

Chapter 6: The Eternal Spirit

Christian Doctrine of God, pp. 59-67, 147-55, 180-94

God and Rationality

Chapter 7: The Epistemological Relevance of the Spirit

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 6: The Holy Spirit

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 6: Torrance's Pneumatology

Colyer, Promise of Trinitarian Theology

Chapter 4: The Holy Spirit in T. F. Torrance's Theology, by Gary W. Deddo

The church

Theology in Reconstruction

Chapter 11: The Foundation of the Church: Union with Christ

This chapter and the one in *The Trinitarian Faith* are Torrance's two most important discussions of ecclesiology.

The Trinitarian Faith

Chapter 7: The One Church

"The Deposit of Faith"

Theology in Reconciliation

Chapter 1: Ecumenism

Chapter 2: The One Baptism Common to Christ and His Church

Chapter 3: The Pascal Mystery of Christ and the Eucharist

Chapter 6: The Church In the New Era of Scientific and Cosmological Change

Royal Priesthood: A Theology of Ordained Ministry.

Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1955, 2nd ed. 1993

This is the most important work of Torrance on ordained ministry, though there are additional discussions in the two volumes next in this list. The first volume of *Conflict and Agreement in the Church* is primarily about ecumenical discussions with various churches and problems in relation to faith and order.

Conflict and Agreement in the Church, vol. 1, Order and Disorder. 1959. Reprint; Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 1996

Conflict and Agreement in the Church, vol. 2, The Ministry and the Sacraments of the Gospel. London: Lutterworth Press, 1960. Reprint; Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 1996

Chapter 1: The Ministry

Chapter 3: The Sacrament of Baptism

Chapter 4: The Sacrament of the Lord's Supper

Kingdom and Church: A Study in the Theology of the Reformation

This volume is on the eschatology of Luther, Butzer, and Calvin, but there are significant discussions of various aspects of ecclesiology in which Torrance's own views are evident.

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 7: The Church, the Body of Christ

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 6: Torrance's Trinitarian Understanding of the Church, Sacraments and Ministry

Colyer, Promise of Trinitarian Theology

Chapter 6: The Dimension of Depth: Thomas F. Torrance on the Sacraments, by George Hunsinger

Chapter 7: Reading T. F. Torrance as a Practical Theologian, by Ray S. Anderson

The Trinity

The Mediation of Christ

Chapter 5: The Atonement and the Trinity

The Trinitarian Faith

Chapter 8: The Triunity of God

This chapter in *The Trinitarian Faith* is probably the best introduction to Torrance's doctrine of the Trinity.

Ground and Grammar

Chapter 6: The Basic Grammar of Theology

Reality and Scientific Theology

Chapter 6: The Trinitarian Structure of Theology

"The Trinitarian Structure of Theology" is an important chapter that deals with methodological considerations concerning how the doctrine of the Trinity arises.

Christian Doctrine of God

This is Torrance's magnum opus. It is one of the most groundbreaking works on the Trinity in the past twenty years. It includes extremely important chapters on methodological questions concerning how the doctrine of the Trinity arises and is a difficult book.

Trinitarian Perspectives: Toward Doctrinal Agreement. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1994

This book arose out of ecumenical dialogue between the Pan-Orthodoxy Churches and the World Alliance of Reformed Churches. Torrance played a crucial role in these dialogues. The book contains many discussions important to Torrance's doctrine of the Trinity.

Readers interested in the dialogue between the Pan-Orthodoxy Churches and the World Alliance of Reformed Churches should consult Thomas F. Torrance, ed., *Theological Dialogue Between Orthodox and Reformed Churches*, 2 vols. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1985–1993.

Colyer, How To Read T. F. Torrance

Chapter 8: The Triunity of God, One Being Three Persons

Molnar, Thomas F. Torrance

Chapter 2: T. F. Torrance, Theologian of the Trinity: The Centrality of the Doctrine of Trinity in Torrance's Theology

Colyer, Promise of Trinitarian Theology

Chapter 5: Being and Person: T. F. Torrance's Doctrine of God, by Colin Gunton

Theological Method and Related Issues

This is by far the most diverse, complex, and difficult area of Torrance's theology. He has published so much in so many subsidiary fields, like the history of hermeneutics and the relation between method in theology and natural science, and his perspective so integrates these various fields that it is difficult even to decide where to begin a reader's guide on this subject. Here it might be wise for those just starting out to read chapter 9, "The Integration of Form in Theology," in my book *How To Read T. F. Torrance* to at least have an overview of this vast array of topics and issues before tackling Torrance's own publications on the subject.

The best way to enter Torrance's perspective in the area of theological method may be to examine his understanding of epistemology, or how we integrate form in our knowing in general and in relation to knowing God in particular. Here it is illuminating to see Torrance's perspective on the integration of form in relation to epistemology in the main stream of Western philosophy, science, and theology, from Descartes and Newton through Hume and Kant to the contributions of Einstein and Polanyi.

Torrance's narrative of this history is not an account of how Torrance came to his epistemological convictions; it simply provides a helpful account by Torrance of his views in relation to the perspectives of other significant thinkers in this area in the modern period. Torrance has written a number of articles and chapters of books on epistemology in modern natural science, philosophy, and theology. The following is the most helpful order in which to read these various publications.

Epistemology: the integration of form

Ground and Grammar

Chapter 2: Emerging from the Cultural Split

Reality and Scientific Theology

Chapter 1: Classical and Modern Attitudes of Mind

Transformation and Convergence in the Frame of Knowledge

Preface

Chapter 1: The Making of the "Modern" Mind from Descartes and Newton To Kant

This is a crucial essay for understanding Torrance on this subject.

Chapter 3: The Place of Michael Polanyi in the Modern Philosophy of Science

Chapter 5: Ultimate Beliefs and the Scientific Revolution

Chapter 8: Newton, Einstein, and Scientific Theology

Chapter 2: The Integration of Form in Natural Science and Theological Science

Ground and Grammar

Chapter 5: Theological Science

Reality and Scientific Theology

Chapter 3: The Science of God

Chapter 4: The Social Coefficient of Knowledge

This chapter, on the social coefficient, is the most important place in Torrance's publications where he deals explicitly with this topic pivotal to many aspects of this whole area of Torrance's thought on theological method, though what he says in the opening chapters of *The Mediation of Christ* about Israel's role in mediating knowledge of God is also germane, as is his article, "The Deposit of Faith."

"Theological Realism," in The Philosophical Frontiers of Christian Theology, ed. B. Hebblethwaite and S. Sutherland, 169–96. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982

Theological Science. London: Oxford University Press, 1969. Reprinted in paperback by T&T Clark, 1996

Theological Science is Torrance's first systematic account of theological science and has a lot of important material, but it does not represent the full later development of his views in the whole area of theological method. Readers should also consult *God and Rationality* (1971; reprint, Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 1997), and *Space, Time and Incarnation* (1969; reprint, Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1997). These three works are an early trilogy designed to prepare the way for a rigorous scientific theology within the modern scientific context (see Torrance, *God and Rationality*, p. ix). Most of the chapters of *God and Rationality* are lectures and previously published essays. Readers interested in Torrance's early views on this subject should consult these three books first and then examine various other essays related to the subject published between 1950 and 1970.

The Christian Frame of Mind

Chapter 2: The Concept of Order in Theology and Science

Chapter 3: Man, Mediator of Order

Chapter 4: Theological and Scientific Inquiry

Chapter 5: Fundamental Issues in Theology and Science

Chapter 6: Realism and Openness in Scientific Inquiry

These five chapters include material important to theological method and epistemology. Also see *Belief in Science and in Christian Life: The Relevance of Michael Polanyi's Thought for Christian Faith and Life* (Edinburgh, Handsel Press, 1980). Torrance edited the work but wrote a helpful introduction and chapter 1: "The Framework of Belief," pp. 1–27.

Hermeneutics

Space, Time and Resurrection

Introduction

Chapter 8: The Lord of Space and Time

Reality and Evangelical Theology

Chapter 2: Theological Questions to Biblical Scholars

Chapter 3: Realist Interpretation of God's Self-Revelation

"The Historical Jesus: From the Perspective of a Theologian." Divine Meaning: Studies in Patristic Hermeneutics, Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1995

Introduction

Chapter 1: The Complex Background of Biblical Interpretation

Chapter 5: Early Interpretation of Holy Scripture

Chapter 8: The Hermeneutics of Athanasius

Chapter 12: Transition to the West: The Interpretation of Biblical and

Theological Statements according to Hilary of Poitiers

The Hermeneutics of John Calvin. Edinburgh:

Scottish Academic Press, 1988

"Hermeneutics according to Schleiermacher."

Scottish Journal of Theology 21 (1968): 257-67.

The nature of truth

Reality and Evangelical Theology

Chapter 4: Truth and Justification in Doctrinal Formulation

Reality and Scientific Theology

Chapter 4: The Stratification of Truth

Transformation and Convergence in the Frame of Knowledge

Chapter 10: Truth and Authority in the Church

Theological method in relation to the doctrine of the Trinity

For those interested in how Torrance's theological method is concretely related to theological content, especially the doctrine of the Trinity, the following chapters trace Torrance's thinking on this subject. Here I have arranged the material in chronological order, as it illumines the growing sophistication of the integration of content and method in Torrance's theology in relation to the Christian doctrine of God, the Trinity. The material in *The Christian Doctrine of God*, from beginning through chapter 4, is perhaps the most developed account written by any theologian to date of how the doctrine of the Trinity arises.

Transformation and Convergence in the Frame of Knowledge

Chapter 2: The Integration of Form in Natural Science and Theological Science

Ground and Grammar

Chapter 6: The Basic Grammar of Theology

Reality and Scientific Theology

Chapter 6: The Trinitarian Structure of Theology

Christian Doctrine of God

Preface and Introduction

Chapter 2: The Christian Perspective

Chapter 3: The Biblical Frame

Chapter 4: The Trinitarian Text

Sermons

For readers interested in Torrance's sermons, the best place to begin is with When Christ Comes and Comes Again (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1957), and The Apocalypse Today (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1959).